

## 12) What caused the current war between Israel and Palestine?

**Sean Davis:**

This really depends on what parameters we are defining as “the current war.” If we are speaking on the mainstream media narrative that this began on October 7<sup>th</sup>, the argument remains that Israel began its campaign as a response to bombardment on Israel apparently carried out by Hamas that happened to penetrate the iron dome defense system as Hamas rebels infiltrated an empty military facility in Northern Israel. I find a lot of inconsistencies with this entire scenario, and it has the Mustara-bim and false flag written all over it. Israel has also been continuously carrying out an onslaught on the Palestinian people since its beginning. October 7<sup>th</sup> would be the date that Netanyahu tried to finesse popularity for the final phase of the Israeli expansion into Palestine and an eventual expansion aligning with the popular Likud belief in Greater Israel.

The official start of the war would be correctly measured by looking at the first interactions between Zionists and the local population they displaced by the establishment of Moshava, one of the first Jewish settlements. One might argue that the land that was established for the first Aliya was owned by wealthy Jews when they had arrived; yes, that is true, but as we have seen with the case of Paul Reuter when he convinced the Shah of Iran to sell off large tracts of land and contracts, the Shah wasn't necessarily acting in the interest of his people, just as we have seen countless times over the semester examples of rulers acting against the popular interest of their citizens for personal gain. The first war between Israel and Palestine began when displacement had begun.

**Dr. L:**

I don't think the idea of a 'false flag' operation makes sense here. A false flag wouldn't explain how 240 Israelis wound up in Hamas custody. It also wouldn't explain why Hamas claimed responsibility for the attacks. They did deny some of the accusations of atrocities (such as raping women and torturing them), but their denials make pretty clear that they think it was their allies--Islamic Jihad-- that may have done those particular things. And I think it's inconceivable that Israel would kill about 1200 of its own citizens specifically to get an excuse to attack Gaza, particularly since this has badly harmed Netanyahu's political reputation and since he thought he had Hamas reduced to a manageable problem that he could use to his own benefit.

**Sean Davis:**

Based on what we've learned in this class about the Lehi, the Irgun, Jabotinsky tactics, and Netanyahu's past with the Likud and the fact he's currently on a tyrannical rampage to remain power in power in which he was to be prosecuted days before October 7th. It all seems a little too convenient to me. The Lavon Affair, as well as the Israel-U.S. collaboration in Operation Northwoods, in addition to the many situations in the Middle East you taught us about, clearly demonstrates the eagerness of the government to play puppet master's on levels and ways we could never imagine. Yes, Hamas claimed responsibility for the attack on the music festival, but Hamas likely doesn't speak for all acting parties in the situation. We have first-hand accounts of Israeli friendly fire in the Kibbutz and at the music festival, where Israel attacked its citizens, which needs further investigation in light of the **Hannibal Doctrine**.

Yes, this is speculation, but I believe it's required in the spirit of informed historical imagination. Who's to say that the group that invaded the vacant base in northern Israel wasn't a sabotage group, let's say the **Mustara-bim**, sent to stir things up? Meanwhile, the core group falls in on the music festival, kidnapping individuals as collateral in exchange for their imprisoned family members that number in the thousands. At the same time, Israel descends upon the Supernova music festival, killing many of its citizens to take out a few terrorists. Again, the mythical Hannibal doctrine is at work. I choose not to buy wholesale the story as mainstream media have spun it because there are too many holes, and the information is being heavily curated.

A variety of factors contributed to October 7th. However, I would put money on the fact that Israel, precisely the Netanyahu regime, in collaboration with whatever current iteration of Irgun or Lehi operating under the Israeli Occupation Forces with impunity, had a hand to play in provoking or striking emotional chords within Hamas at some level, in preparation for October 7th. I also believe that the U.S. And the other common allies also played a role. It wasn't Israel or Hamas that acted alone but multiple parties (Saudi Arabia, Egypt, The Entire Western / Imperial powers) orchestrating this event in the theatre of war.

**Dr. L:**

Again, the fact that Hamas took hostages and claimed responsibility for the act strongly works against your argument. It's hard to imagine that Netanyahu has the capacity of manipulate Hamas leadership the way your theory suggests. And the attack sharply weakened Netanyahu's long-term political prospects in ways that would have been highly predictable to those who follow Israeli politics, so the idea that Netanyahu did this makes little sense.

There is a long history of antisemitic conspiracy theories that depict the Jews as engaging in abominable acts such as kidnapping and murdering babies. Claiming that Netanyahu orchestrated the slaughter of his own people to achieve a political goal fall into that same sort of thinking. So, you're getting very close to outright antisemitism, Sean. It is entirely legitimate to criticize and denounce Netanyahu's documented actions--his decisions in the war come very close to the legal definition of genocide. So, if you want to criticize him, focus on that. You don't need to invent unprovable conspiracy theories that tap into old notions of Jews as manipulative monsters to criticize him. And note that by citing groups like the Ergun to justify an accusation against Netanyahu (who was barely born when those groups were active), you're essentially argued that Jews as a group have a tendency toward malevolent scheming.

You note that there are holes in the media narrative. Of course, there are--in wartime it's hard to gather evidence for all sorts of reasons. That means that as historians, we must be extremely cautious in how we speculate. It is one thing to speculate by extrapolating from known facts to near-but-unknown facts (did Netanyahu shut down the Rafah crossing to increase pressure on the Gazans by restricting their supplies? I can't prove it, but it does fit a pattern of how Israel has conducted the war.) It's a very different thing to speculate about unknown participants doing nefarious things ("who's to say that group that group that invaded Northern Israel...wasn't a sabotage group...sent to stir things up?") Absence of evidence does not prove a point. The fact that we don't know doesn't mean we get to invent facts to allow us to answer a very leading question.

Sean Davis:

I didn't say a single thing antisemitic; I'm merely pointing out the facts that the Irgun and Lehi have been absorbed by the Israeli Occupation Forces, which is also widely known. I didn't mention anything that references the global Jewish population. I'm not sure how you can be skeptical about the occurrences of the Iraq War yet remain in your current camp regarding the current situation in Palestine when, in fact, Israel (Not Jews as a whole, not even all Israeli Jews), the U.S., and nearly the entire West have been in collaboration for a long time.

Here's some substantial evidence.

[Israeli Army Probing Death of 12 Hostages in Kibbutz Be'eri House Shelled on Orders of Senior Officer](#)[Links to an external site.](#)

[Israeli military opens probe into reports of Oct. 7 friendly fire deaths.](#)[Links to an external site.](#)

The facts remain: the Israeli Occupation Forces killed many of their own on October 7th, and it's a fact that needs to be considered while keeping in mind what we know about historical Western intervention and tactics, especially those of which we know have

been historically employed by Israel. **Antisemitism is a problem, but I think a more significant issue is the misuse of the term as a scapegoat, allowing a break for Israel from its questionable historical actions as if they were two separate entities.** They're not. I don't believe a single Jew at any rally across the United States / the world today, or the population as a whole, harbors the same feelings as the extreme right in Israel. Still, I retain the right to be critical of anyone, as do you and everyone else, at least until we turn into a purely fascist system.

This is another account, a separate account of friendly fire.

[Anger at Israeli government mounts after military admits to mistakenly killing hostages Links to an external site.](#)

Hundreds took to the streets of Tel Aviv after it emerged that Israel's soldiers had killed at least three Israeli hostages in Gaza.

To speak on the sabotage, it obviously wouldn't be Netanyahu directly communicating with Hamas or any group; there's always an intermediary, someone who's established trust and used persuasion to fan flames. The fact that one group took hostages does not dismiss the possibility of other groups, nor does it account for Hamas descending upon the music festival without prior knowledge of the festival. Still, seemingly entering Israel against no defense but met with helicopter and mass onslaught only just after arrival, that resulted in both Hamas and civilian deaths? And still, they escape on rickety motorbikes against choppers and tanks. Yeah right. The U.S. and Israel have deep roots in disinformation and destabilization campaigns as well as campaigns to gain widespread interest. It's a disservice on any of our parts to overlook every detail, especially hosting historical knowledge and the availability of a wealth of active information at our fingertips.

Israel - Hamas relations. This, too, however, is curated information made available to you after being sterilized.

[For years, Netanyahu propped up Hamas. Now it's blown up in our faces Links to an external site.](#)

Just like our sources at home are highly curated.

[CNN RUNS GAZA COVERAGE PAST JERUSALEM TEAM OPERATING UNDER SHADOW OF IDF CENSOR](#)

I had to dig for these last couple of sources. It doesn't add up.

Hamas could have been working with intel as simple as they knew the base, they approached from would be vacant. They didn't know the music festival was happening<sup>1</sup>, the music festival had moved multiple times before the event, with the last move two days before the event (October 7th, 2023)<sup>2</sup>, and Israeli police officers had stressed their concern about the new location<sup>3</sup>. You really don't think any of this seems strange? Hamas was tipped to a location, and simultaneously, the event was moved to the exact location and orchestrated by a single entity. Neither Hamas nor the Patrons of Supernova knew what would happen that day.

Netanyahu had now bought time against his prosecution and inevitable sentence because he was an absolute tyrant, having nothing to do with his faith, in addition to the known and widely expressed interest of the Likud in a Greater Israel.

1 [Josh BreinerLinks to an external site.](#), Israeli Security Establishment: Hamas Likely Didn't Have Advance Knowledge of Nova Festival, <https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/2023-11-18/ty-article/.premium/israeli-security-establishment-hamas-likely-didnt-have-prior-knowledge-of-nova-festival/0000018b-e2ee-d168-a3ef-f7fe8ca20000Links to an external site.> (2023)

2 [Katie BainLinks to an external site.](#), Artist Manager Describes Israeli Rave Massacre: 'It Turned Into a Nightmare', <https://www.billboard.com/music/music-news/israel-music-festival-attack-artist-manager-account-massacre-1235436829/Links to an external site.> (2023)

3 [TOI STAFFLinks to an external site.](#), Key IDF officer reportedly voiced concern about Nova festival but was told to OK it, <https://www.timesofisrael.com/key-idf-officer-reportedly-voiced-concern-about-nova-festival-but-was-told-to-ok-it/Links to an external site.> (2023)

Dr. L:

Sean, I am not going to debate conspiracy theories with you. Instead, I am going to close this thread.